



City of Santa Barbara

HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

MINUTES

APRIL 5, 2017

1:30 P.M.
David Gebhard Public Meeting Room
630 Garden Street
SantaBarbaraCA.gov

COMMISSION MEMBERS:

William La Voie, *Chair*
Philip Suding, *Vice Chair*
Michael Drury
Anthony Grumbine
Bill Mahan
Fermina Murray
Judy Orías
Julio J. Veyna

ADVISORY MEMBER: Dr. Michael Glassow

CITY COUNCIL LIAISON: Jason Dominguez

PLANNING COMMISSION LIAISON: Sheila Lodge

STAFF:

Jaime Limón, Design Review Supervisor
Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian
Pilar Plummer, Planning Technician
Jennifer Sanchez, Commission Secretary

An archived video of this meeting is available at SantaBarbaraCA.gov/HLCVideos.

CALL TO ORDER

The Full Commission meeting was called to order at 1:30 p.m. by Chair La Voie.

ATTENDANCE

Members present: Drury, Grumbine (at 2:29 p.m.), La Voie (absent 2:36-3:30 p.m.), Mahan, Orías, Suding (absent 2:36-3:30 p.m.), and Veyna

Members absent: Murray

Staff present: Limón (until 2:36 p.m.), Hernandez, Plummer, and Sanchez

GENERAL BUSINESS

A. Public Comment:

No public comment.

B. Approval of Minutes:

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **March 17, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Suding/Drury, 5/0/1. (Suding abstained from Items 5-6. Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

Motion: Approve the minutes of the Historic Landmarks Commission meeting of **March 22, 2017**, as amended.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 5/0/1. (Suding abstained from Items 6-8. Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

C. Consent Calendar:

Motion: Ratify the Consent Calendar of **April 5, 2017**, as reviewed by Commissioner Mahan and Commissioner Veyna.

Action: Suding/Drury, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

D. Announcements, requests by applicants for continuances and withdrawals, future agenda items, and appeals:

1. Commissioner Mahan announced that he spoke to board members of the Santa Barbara Trust for Historic Preservation regarding concerns about the temporary fencing at Casa De La Guerra. He requested that staff invite the Trust to discuss a timeline for removal of the fence and a proper solution with the Commission.
2. Ms. Plummer announced the following:
 - a. Commissioner Grumbine will arrive late.
 - b. For concept reviews that are comments only, a motion is still required. For 226 E. Anapamu Street, reviewed on March 22, the Commission provided comments only; the applicant is requesting a four-week continuance to April 19.
3. Commissioner Suding announced that he will be absent from the April 19 meeting, and he will step down from Item 8, Cabrillo Ball Park.
4. Commissioner Drury stated that the bridge over Mission Creek at Cabrillo Boulevard is blocking views. Mr. Limón responded that after the recent storms, the long-term stability of the bridge is a concern, and its removal has been recommended.
5. Mr. Limón announced the following:
 - a. On April 18, the Infill Design Guidelines will be reviewed for adoption by the City Council, as recommended by the HLC.
 - b. Staff is working on additional submittal requirements specifically for Average Unit-Size Density (AUD) Incentive Program projects; a draft handout will be shared with the HLC.
6. Chair La Voie requested that Commissioners do not take telephone calls during meetings. If a call must be taken, do not return until the item is over. Do not interrupt an applicant presentation, except for a point of order. In addition, he will step down from Item 8, Cabrillo Ball Park.

C. Subcommittee Reports:

No subcommittee reports.

DISCUSSION ITEM**1. AMENDMENTS TO HISTORIC STRUCTURES ORDINANCE- CHAPTER 22.22 OF SANTA BARBARA MUNICIPAL CODE**

(1:45) Staff: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner

(A. Staff summary report of Ordinance Committee meeting and brief overview of proposed changes to SBMC Chapter 22.22.)

(B. Consider request to form an ad hoc HLC subcommittee to review historic districting changes to Santa Barbara Municipal Code (SBMC) Chapter 22.22, Historic Structures.)

Actual time: 1:54 p.m.

Present: Jaime Limón, Senior Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Discussion held.

Commission comments:

1. Commissioners La Voie, Mahan, and Orías will serve on the subcommittee.
2. Mary Louise Days, Steve Dowty, and Sheila Lodge were recommended to serve.
3. Send copies of the PowerPoint presentation to the subcommittee members.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**2. 901 N MILPAS ST**

(2:05) Assessor's Parcel Number: 029-313-015

Owner: Philindia Properties

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on May 3, 2017 to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark designation of the Live Oak Dairy building located at 901 North Milpas Street (also known as 900 Philinda Avenue).)

Actual time: 2:19 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:20 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-4 to hold a Public Hearing on May 3, 2017 to consider a recommendation for Landmark designation of the Live Oak Dairy building located at 901 North Milpas Street (also known as 900 Philinda Avenue.)

Action: Mahan/Suding, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**3. 1301-1303A STATE ST****(2:10)**Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 039-131-013, 039-131-014,
039-131-015Owners: First Church/Christ SCI/SB, Bosse Toy Train Museum,
Inc., Koch Family Trust

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on May 3, 2017 to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark designation of the Kem Webber building located at 1301-1303A State Street.)

Actual time: 2:23 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:24 p.m.

Mary Louise Days stated that the removal of a monument bench in front of the building was a significant loss to this corner.

Public comment closed at 2:25 p.m.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-5 to hold a Public Hearing on May 3, 2017 to consider a recommendation for Landmark designation of the Kem Webber building located at 1301-1303A State Street, with comment:

1. Include a photograph of the historic bench in the Staff Report.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**4. 214 E DE LA GUERRA ST****(2:15)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-082-002

Owner: The Betty Jo Lauritson Trust

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on May 3, 2017 to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark designation of the Ygnacio House located at 214 East De La Guerra Street.)

Actual time: 2:27 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:28 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-06 to hold a Public Hearing on May 3, 2017 to consider a recommendation for Landmark designation of Ygnacio House located at 214 East De La Guerra Street.

Action: Suding/Drury, 6/0/0. (Grumbine and Murray absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**5. 600 OLIVE ST****(2:20)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 031-171-006

Owner: Jeanette Arnoldi-Schall Irrevocable Trust

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on May 3, 2017 to consider a recommendation to the City Council for Landmark designation of the Arnoldi's Restaurant located at 600 Olive Street.)

Actual time: 2:29 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:30 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-7 to hold a Public Hearing on May 3, 2017 to consider a recommendation for Landmark designation of Arnoldi's Restaurant located at 600 Olive Street.

Action: Suding/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

MISCELLANEOUS ACTION ITEM: RESOLUTION OF INTENTION**6. 1809 MIRA VISTA AVE****(2:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-090-026

Owner: John and Daryl Stegall

(The Commission is requested to adopt a Resolution of Intention to hold a Public Hearing on April 19, 2017 to consider designating the Tudor Revival style house designed by Soule, Murphy, and Hastings in 1925 located at 1809 Mira Vista Avenue as a Structure of Merit.)

Actual time: 2:31 p.m.

Present: Nicole Hernandez, Urban Historian, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 2:32 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To adopt Resolution of Intention 2017-3 to hold a Public Hearing on April 19, 2017 to consider Structure of Merit designation of the Tudor Revival style house constructed in 1925 located at 1809 Mira Vista Avenue.

Action: Suding/Veyna, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

ARCHAEOLOGY REPORT**7. 208 OCEANO AVE****R-2/SD-3 Zone****(2:30)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 045-074-007
Application Number: MST2016-00023
Owner: Tantri, LLC
Architect: Craig Goodman

(Proposal for major remodel, partial demolition, and reconfiguration of an existing two-story duplex, which will result in a 1,400 square foot duplex at the rear of an 8,756 square foot parcel. The duplex will include a 330 square foot covered porch on the ground floor, remodeled 302 square foot uncovered deck on the second floor, and a new stairway. A portion of the structure will be demolished, including as-built work, as part of the major remodel to alter the structure to a Spanish architectural style. The garage size will be increased and building footprint widened to provide a reduced 3 foot side yard setback at the ground floor. Four tandem covered parking spaces are proposed in the new parking configuration. Other site work will include the replacement of existing fencing with new site walls, a new raised planters, new driveway, hardscape, landscaping, and a relocated trash enclosure. The existing four unit apartment building at the front of the site also requires approval of as-built window replacements, proposed storage, and a new entry. Requires Staff Hearing Officer approval of a zoning modification to provide less than the required open yard area. Three parking design waivers are being requested from the Transportation Division. This proposal will address violations identified in Zoning Information Report ZIR2015-00524.)

(Review of Phase I Archaeological Resources Report prepared by Brent Leftwich.)

Actual time: 2:33 p.m.

Staff comments: Ms. Plummer stated that Dr. Glassow has reviewed the report and concluded that the archaeological investigation supports the report's conclusions and recommendations. The standard condition regarding the discovery of unanticipated archaeological resources will apply.

Public comment opened at 2:34 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: To accept the report as submitted, forwarding support for the landscape plan to the Architectural Board of Review.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

*** THE COMMISSION RECESSED FROM 2:36 TO 2:44 P.M. ***

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**8. CABRILLO BALL PARK****P-R/SD-3 Zone****(2:35)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 017-311-001
Application Number: MST2016-00144
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Justin Van Mullem

(Proposal for renovations to the Cabrillo Ball Park. Renovation project includes redesigned park entries, outdoor fitness equipment stations, and a new pathway. Also proposed are new landscaping improvements, accessibility improvements, renovation of the ball field turf and irrigation, exterior lighting at the existing restrooms, and pedestrian lighting. Three Calle Puerto Vallarta street parking spaces will be removed to provide space for an accessible sidewalk improvement. Approximately nine (9) trees will be removed, one palm relocated, and 12 new trees installed. The project will be reviewed by Planning Commission for a Coastal Development Permit.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project must comply with Planning Commission Resolution No. 033-16. Project was last reviewed on October 19, 2016.)

Actual time: 2:44 p.m.

Present: Courtney Jane Miller and Katie Kline, Landscape Architects, CJMLA; and Justin Van Mullem, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:10 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and continued to Consent with comments:

1. For the iron railing on sheet L6, detail 8, the curve should be continuous and not segmented.
2. The Commission preferred the Canary Island palm tree at the corner.
3. The Commission found that the project complies with PC Resolution 033-016.

Action: Grumbine/Drury, 5/0/0. (La Voie and Suding stepped down. Murray absent.)
Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

PROJECT DESIGN REVIEW**9. 202 W CABRILLO BLVD****HRC-1/SD-3 Zone****(3:00)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 033-092-008
Application Number: MST2016-00173
Owner: HHLP Santa Barbara I Assoc, LLC
Architect: Joe Andrulaitis + Mixon

(Proposal to permit an "as-built" awning at the entrance of Hotel Milo to abate a zoning violation. Staff Hearing Officer review is requested to allow the awning to encroach into the required front setback. This property is located in the Appealable Jurisdiction of the Coastal Zone and is on the City's Potential Historic Resources List: Ambassador-By-the-Sea Motel, constructed in 1951.)

(Action may be taken if sufficient information is provided. Project was last reviewed on May 18, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:30 p.m.

Present: Joe Andrulaitis, Architect

Public comment opened at 3:33 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Project Design Approval and Final Approval as submitted.

Action: Suding/Mahan, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

The ten-day appeal period was announced.

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW**10. 1232 DE LA VINA ST****P-R Zone****(3:25)**

Assessor's Parcel Number: 039-172-005
Application Number: MST2016-00489
Owner: City of Santa Barbara
Applicant: Justin Van Mullem

(This building is a designated Structure of Merit: Louis Lowry Davis Center. Proposal for minor exterior building and site changes to the existing one-story masonry Parks and Recreation building. Exterior alterations include replacing selected windows with doors, constructing a new plaster and wood pergola and new 6-foot tall wrought iron fencing to enclose a new courtyard, and for a new accessible ramp and steps for courtyard access. The project includes the relocation of the primary entry from De La Vina Street to the north elevation facing the parking lot, the removal of the entry steps and site path and installation of balcony railing at the De La Vina Street entrance, and the construction of two new trellis structures. New landscaping, site lighting, and interior alterations are also proposed. A Zoning Modification is requested to allow the proposed trellis to encroach into the required 10' interior setback.)

(Comments Only. Project requires review by Staff Hearing Officer for the requested Zoning Modification. Project was last reviewed on November 16, 2016.)

Actual time: 3:37 p.m.

Present: Ellen Bildstein, Architect, Bildstein Architecture and Planning; and Justin Van Mullem, Associate Planner, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 3:47 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer for return to Consent with comments:

1. The Commission appreciated the response to previous comments and commended the applicant for an elegant and appropriate design.
2. Study the color of the columns, with the suggestion of using the cream/faux limestone color present elsewhere on the building. Also, study the color of the body of the kitchen addition, perhaps a compatible darker color with the lighter pilasters.
3. Replace the 1960s door in the kitchen.
4. Use a less rustic light fixture, with frosted glass and a low temperature, approximately 2700K.
5. On the site plan, show bike racks appropriate to the historic resource, and the trash enclosure.
6. The landscape as proposed is acceptable.
7. The Commission made the finding that the proposed modification does not impede on the adjacent property and is aesthetically appropriate.
8. The design is worthy of Project Design Approval.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

REVIEW AFTER FINAL

11. 0 BLK W YANONALI ST 2069 SEG ID

(3:50)

Assessor's Parcel Number:	ROW-002-069
Application Number:	MST2016-00236
Owner:	City of Santa Barbara
Applicant:	Matthew Griffin
Designer:	Aric Torreyson

(Proposal to construct a double reinforced concrete box culvert along lower Mission Creek, beginning at the terminus of Reach1B, located just northeast of 120 Chapala Street. The box culvert continues upstream (northerward) through Yanonali Street, immediately adjacent to the Chapala Street Bridge and terminating just south of the Railroad tracks at the location of the completed Railroad Depot By-Pass Culvert Extension Project. The construction of the box culvert will remove and replace hardscape improvements along Yanonali Street and the remnant Chapala Street right-of-way and include limited site improvements at 134 Chapala Street.)

(Review After Final is requested to replace approximately 100 linear feet of the damaged Mission Creek sandstone wall with sandstone form liner wall, a sandstone cap, and pipe handrail.)

Actual time: 4:08 p.m.

Present: Adam Hendel, Principal Engineer, City of Santa Barbara

Public comment opened at 4:12 p.m.

Correspondence from Paulina Conn with concerns was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 4:12 p.m.

Motion: Approval of Review After Final with comments:

1. The Commission referred the proposal to the Urban Creeks Council for review of elements of the new wall that can possibly be enhanced for fish passage. Return to Consent if significant change occurs after this review.
2. Replicate as closely as possible the color and texture of the sandstone wall on the other side of the creek.

Action: Mahan/Drury, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

FINAL REVIEW

12. 418 STATE ST & 416 STATE ST

C-M Zone

(4:15)

Assessor's Parcel Numbers: 037-212-024, 037-212-023
Application Number: MST2017-00044
Owner: Gregory D. & Cheryl L. Young
Owner: Hughes Land Holding Trust
Agent: Kevin Moore

(Proposal includes a lot tie between 418 and 416 State Street with interior and exterior improvements to occur at both parcels. Site improvements at 418 State Street include a remodel of the front façade, new flooring at the rear to become outdoor dining, and interior improvements. The existing detached storage structure behind 416 State Street will be remodeled to become a kitchen and storage space with exterior improvements to include new windows and doors. The existing parking lot will be adjusted to provide 4 uncovered parking spaces including an Americans with Disabilities Act parking space, a new trash enclosure, and bike parking. The site is within the 50% Parking Zone of Benefit.)

(Final Approval is requested. Project Design Approval received on March 17, 2017.)

Actual time: 4:25 p.m.

Present: Kevin Moore, Architect; and Nicole Horn, Landscape Architect, CJMLA

Public comment opened at 4:34 p.m., and as no one wished to speak, it closed.

Straw vote: How many Commissioners can support the proposed metal canopy? 1/6 Failed
How many Commissioners can support a more traditional solution, not in metal?
5/2 Passed

Motion: Continued two weeks with comments:

1. Establish more consistency in the expression of the mullions on the windows and doors, and the expression needs to be more traditional than contemporary.
2. All of the doors need to look more traditional.
3. The relationship of panel to frame in the proposed doors needs to be more traditional, and not modern and slender.
4. The metal canopies as designed are not acceptable and should be more traditional; return with an example from a historic building.

5. Consider a substitution for the *sansevieria cylindrica*; the landscape plan is otherwise acceptable.
6. On sheet A3.01, the gate needs to be shown as verticals.
7. At the trash enclosure, the plaster dividing wall needs to be expressed as wider or in wood.

Action: Mahan/Suding, 7/0/0. (Murray absent.) Motion carried.

*** MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:04 P.M. ***